

Case No: HQ16X01238, HQ17X02637 and HQ17X04248

Neutral Citation Number: [2019] EWHC 3408 (QB)

THE POST OFFICE GROUP LITIGATION
IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUSTICE
QUEENS BENCH DIVISION

Rolls Building
Fetter Lane
London, EC4A 1NL

Date: 16 December 2019

Before :

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FRASER

Between :

Alan Bates and Others

Claimant

- and -

Post Office Limited

Defendant

Appendix 2

Summary of Bugs, Errors, Defects

Judgment (No.6) “Horizon Issues”

Summary of Bugs, Errors and Defects (Legacy Horizon or Online) and Years Experienced

1. Receipts and Payments Mis-match bug.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online

This bug occurred in 2010.

The majority of incidents are recorded as occurring between August and October 2010.

2. Callendar Square/Falkirk bug.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

It is agreed that this bug occurred between the years of 2000 and 2006, although there is an issue about when it stopped. In my judgment, the period when the effects of this occurred are 2000 to 2010.

3. Suspense Account bug.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

Its identified years of effect are 2010 to 2013.

4. Dalmellington bug/Branch Outreach Issue.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

Its effects were experienced between 2010 and 2015.

5. Remming In bug.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

It was present for about five months in 2010 between March and August.

6. Remming Out bug

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

It was split into two in the Bug Table, 6(i) and 6(ii).

Bug 6(i) was identified as February/April 2007, recorded as fixed approx. 2007. Bug 6(ii) was in May 2005.

7. Local Suspense Account issue, not the same as 3. Suspense Account bug

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

This was reported in 2010 and recorded as fixed in September 2010.

8. Recovery Issues.

These are bugs, errors and defects present in Horizon Online.

With years of effect from 2010 to 2018.

9. Reversals.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

Occurred for a short period in 2003.

10. Data Tree Build Failure discrepancies.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

Its identified effect was during 1999 and 2000, running up to 2007.

11. Girobank discrepancies.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

This is treated as a single bug by the experts in the Bug Table. The Technical Appendix finds there was more than one bug, error or defect under this heading.

It occurred between May and September 2000.

12. Counter-replacement issues.

This is a bug, error, or defect present in Legacy Horizon. It also included hardware issues.

There were two KELs associated with this. The first was created in 2000 and last updated in July 2007. The second was created in 2002 and notes occurrences running up to 2009.

13. Withdrawn stock discrepancies.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

Mentioned in 2010 and 2011.

14. Bureau discrepancies.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

It arose in 2017.

15. Phantom Transactions.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon. This is referable to Horizon issue 4 and not Horizon issue 1.

It arose in 2001.

16. Reconciliation issues.

This is a bug present in both Legacy Horizon and Horizon Online.

This is not a bug with a potential to cause impact on branch accounts. The underlying PEAKs do however demonstrate software faults.

Mentioned in 2000, 2002, 2010 and 2014.

17. Branch Customer discrepancies.

This arises in Legacy Horizon. This is referable to Horizon issue 4 and not Horizon issue 1.

This is an error, or defect and does not have the potential to cause impact to branch accounts.

Occurred in March 2008.

18. Concurrent logins.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

This occurred in 1999 and 2000, and the PEAKS run to 2002.

19. Post & Go/TA discrepancies in POLSAP.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

Occurred in 2012

20. Recovery Failures.

This arises under Horizon Online. This is referable to Horizon issue 4 and not Horizon issue 1.

Two of the PEAKs show errors and defects, they do not show bugs.

Mentioned in 2010, 2012 and 2015.

21. Transaction Correction Issues.

This arises in Legacy Horizon. This is referable to Horizon issue 4 and not Horizon issue 1. Although the Technical Appendix finds it is evidence of a bug, there is no impact on branch accounts.

Occurred in 2005 to 2010.

22. Bugs/errors/defects introduced by previously applied PEAK fixes.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon. There is no impact on branch accounts and this is therefore taken into account under Horizon issue 4 and Horizon issue 1.

Some of the PEAKS are from 2000 and one is from 2004.

23. Bureau de change.

This is a bug present in both Legacy Horizon and Horizon Online.

Arose in 2005, 2006 and 2010 onwards.

24. Wrong branch customer change displayed.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

Occurred in 2005.

25. Lyca top up.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

Occurred in August 2010.

26. TPSC 250 Report.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

The date range is between 2005 and 2009, with the majority of the incidents occurring in 2005

27. TPS.

This is a bug present in Legacy Horizon.

Its years of effect are 2006 to 2010

28. Drop and Go.

This is a bug present in Horizon Online.

Occurred in July 2017. The date of the KEL suggests HNG-A, but the KEL is expressly headed HNG-X.

29. Network Banking Bug.

This arises under Legacy Horizon.

This did not have financial impact on branch accounts. It is an error, or defect but arises from communication failures from outside Horizon, probably from equipment or lines provided by BT.

KEL raised in 2004 and updated in 2005, with 12 associated PEAKs in the range 2004 and continuing on to 2010 when Legacy Horizon was discontinued.